

Essay on Ghadir -Contents

By Zulfiqar Ali email: minds.islam@gmail.com

Reality- Status of Muslims.....	2
Holy prophets (s.a.w.a.) physical presence.....	5
Differences immediately After Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)	6
An Analysis	12
Ghadir	15
Location of Ghadir:	16
Date	16
Event Backdrop:	16
After the Last pilgrimage:	17
Revelation of the verse 5:3.....	19
Hassan Bin Thabit’s poetry:.....	19
Oath of allegiance:	20
Revelation of the verse 70:1-3	21
Excuses & Rebuttals:	22
Excuse 1:& Rebuttal	23
The tradition of Ghadir is not reliable and authentic	23
Excuse 2& Rebuttal:The word ‘Moula’ means friend.....	23
Excuse3&Rebuttal: So many companions disobeyed?.....	23
Ghadir in the words of a Non-Muslim:	40
Ghadir as a feast:.....	41
Ghadir in respect of the Present Imam (a.s.) Our role:	41
Books related to Ghadir:	45

Reality- Status of Muslims

By Zulfiqar Ali email: minds.islam@gmail.com

We are compelled to ask ourselves two questions. What status did Islam want the Muslims to achieve? & What status have the Muslims actually achieved?

The answer to the first question is comparatively much easy to digest. Three times does the Holy Quran repeats:

“He it is who sent His apostle with guidance and the religion of truth that he might cause it to prevail over all religions...”¹

Also the Holy Quran enunciates:

“Surely the land is Allah’s; He causes such of His servants to inherit it as He pleases.”²

But the answer to the second question hits the belly – and indeed hits it hard. Today’s Muslim does not stand anywhere near victory.The parable of the Muslim is that of a football. Being kicked from one end to another. Some do kick to get material benefits. Majority are the people who seek pure entertainment by being the spectators and at times the cheerleaders. This reality slaps, smack, on our faces.

¹ 9:33, 48:28, 61:9.

² 7:128.

The somberness of this fact burns our hearts. It persuades us to do the much-needed research in order to comprehend the underlying fundamentals to this stark variation ie. What the Quran explicitly mentions compared to what we observe in the socio-political transnational personality of the contemporary Muslim.

In this research to pursue the reality, we must promise ourselves to uphold and follow the genuine research ‘wherever it leads to’. Pursuit for truth without the sincere intent and the firm resolve has no meaning. Before we venture out in the realm of sincere research and quest for truth we take caution and endeavor to improve our resolve with these words “There are few nudities so objectionable as the naked truth – Agnes Repplier. Further we sincerely pray that we take our faith seriously and not to be included in those who have been mentioned with the words “He wears his faith but as the fashion of his hat - William Shakespeare. We take courage in these words “All truths are easy to understand once they are discovered; the point is to discover them - Galileo Galilei (1564 - 1642). And also “Truth is generally the best vindication against slander – Abraham Lincoln.

Let us first analyze where did the Muslims go wrong in their vast history presently spread over more than 14 centuries. Where did the first falsehood creep into the history of the Muslims? We will not leave any stone unturned and any page unread to locate this falsehood and ultimately eliminate it.

There are two ways to this analysis. One is we initiate from the contemporary to the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Second is we initiate from the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to the contemporary. We know that if there is a falsehood in the past then it multiplies with time; therefore, we take the second option, starting from the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to the present. It would have been an increasingly arduous affair to analyze the complex form of the falsehood in the recent times without analyzing the comparatively bare and raw form of the falsehood in the previous times. When we mention ‘bare form of the falsehood’ we definitely have taken great pains in comprehending what a ‘falsehood’ means and implies. This indicates that there do exist different forms of falsehood. There are 2 kinds of falsehoods. One is in its bare status, which is in its nascent elementary form, and the other is the falsehood garbed with truth that is the complicated form. The Holy Quran says:

“Do not mix the truth with the falsehood.”¹

In this verse the Holy Quran exhorts the people not to mix truth and falsehood together. Simply speaking, the Holy Quran could have asked us to leave falsehood. But it is needless to mention here that the Holy Quran wants to specify here the second form of falsehood that is exceedingly dangerous than simple elementary form of falsehood. This falsehood is the complex form of falsehood that is mixed with truth and is

¹ 2:42.

perceived as truth at the outset. Only when a person ponders over the reality of this he comes to understand that it is in reality a falsehood and not truth. But the more simple minded people and those who do not ponder a lot get hooked and start considering this falsehood as being the real form of truth. These people start believing this complex form of falsehood as the truth in such a way that they are more than willing to even sacrifice their lives for this complex falsehood, of course, under the impression that this is truth by itself. But even for such people it can rightly be said “Men occasionally stumble over the truth, but most of them pick themselves up and hurry off as if nothing ever happened” – Winston Churchill. There is another group of people who are impure at heart. They are quite aware about this complex falsehood and comprehend that this is falsehood but choose to stick by this falsehood rather than the truth. “I believe in looking at reality straight in the eye and denying it.” - Garrison Keillor.

No mistakes during Holy prophets (s.a.w.a.) physical presence

Beginning from the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), firstly, we are sure that nothing went wrong in the time when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was alive. Since we know very well that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was at the helm of the affairs of the Muslims and no mistakes could be attributed to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). It is sufficient to say that at least no Muslim believes that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) committed any mistake that ultimately has caused such tragic oppressions

of the Muslims. Also, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has received a certificate from Allah (s.w.t.) that he will not err in the affairs of the Muslims in the following verses of the Holy Quran:

“Your companion does not err, nor does he go astray; Nor does he speak out of desire. It is naught but a revelation that is revealed.”¹

Also the Holy Quran certifies all his actions by asking everyone to follow each and every action of his without any exception, this verse has been repeated tens of times in the Holy Quran:

“Obey Allah and obey the Prophet.”²

Our journey for seeking truth has started from the life of the Holy Prophet and is supposed to ultimately terminate at the contemporary. So the next stage which should not miss our stringent perusal is the period immediately after the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Differences immediately After Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)-

Immediately after the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) we observe big differences taking place amongst the Muslims. We can proffer more than 40,000 instances displaying the terrible differences that had occurred after the

¹ 53: 2, 3, & 4.

² 3:32, 3:132, 4:59, 8:1, 8:20, 8:46.

passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). But since the scope of this document is highly limited, in order to indicate the extent of differences taking place after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), it is sufficient to enunciate the following 12 points:

1. Abu Ja'far Baladhuri Ahmad Bin Yahya Bin Jabir Baghdadi, one of reliable traditionalists and historians according to the Sunnis, writes in his History that when Abu Bakr called Ali to swear allegiance, Ali refused. Abu Bakr sent Umar who went with a torch to set fire to Ali's house. Fatima came to the door and said: "O son of Khattab! Have you come to set my house on fire?" He said: "Yes, this is more effective than anything your father did."
2. Sharhe Nahju'l-Balagha, Volume III, page 351. Ibn Abi'l-Hadid wrote that he told his teacher, Abu Ja'far Naqib, that when the Prophet was told that Hubbar Bin Aswad had attacked his daughter Zainab's litter with a lance, because of which Zainab suffered a miscarriage, the Prophet allowed him to be put to death. Abu Ja'far said:

"Had the Prophet of Allah been alive, he would have surely ordered the death penalty for him also who had frightened Fatima so much that her child, Muhsin, died in miscarriage."
3. Hazrat Hussein (a.s.) the grandson of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was martyred along with his family members.

4. When Abdullah learned that, like other copies of the Holy Quran, his copy had been burnt, he was much aggrieved. In social and religious gatherings, he narrated the condemnatory hadith that he knew about Uthman. When this news reached Uthman, he had Ibn Mas'ud so severely beaten by his slaves that his teeth were broken, and he was confined to bed. After three days he succumbed to his injuries. Ibn Abi'l-Hadid writes in detail about these facts in Volume I, pages 67 and 226 of Sharh Nahju'l-Balagha (printed in Egypt) under "Ta'n VI.
5. Ulema of both sects relate that when Umayyad oppression increased, some companions of the Prophet wrote to Uthman, asking him to relent. They said that if he continued to assist his cruel Umayyad Governors, he would not only be harming Islam, but he would himself be subjected to serious consequences. They asked Ammar Yasir to deliver the petition since Uthman himself had acknowledged Ammar's virtue. They had often heard Uthman say that the Prophet said that faith was blended with the flesh and blood of Ammar. So Ammar took the letter to Uthman. When he arrived, Uthman asked him, "Do you have business with me?" He replied: "I have no business of a personal nature. But a group of the Prophet's Companions have written in this letter some suggestions and advice for your welfare. They have sent them to you through me." After reading a few

lines, Uthman threw the letter down. Ammar said: “It was not good of you. A letter from the companions of the Holy Prophet of Allah deserves respect. Why did you throw it on the ground? It would be proper for you to have read it and replied to it?” “You are lying!” Uthman shouted. Then he ordered his slaves to beat him, and Uthman himself kicked him in the stomach.

6. Uthman was also cruel to Jandab Bin Junada, known as Abu Dharr Ghifari, one of the intimate companions of the Holy Prophet and a learned man. Great traditionalists and historians of both sects have reported that this ninety-year-old man was unjustly exiled from place to place with utmost ignominy – from Medina to Syria, to Medina again, and then from Medina to the desert of Rabza. He rode on a naked camel accompanied by his only daughter. He died in Rabza in penury and neglect. Sunni prominent ulema and historians, including, Ibn Sa’d, in his *Tabaqat*, Volume IV, page 168; Bukhari in *Sahih*, *Kitab-e-Zakat*; Ibn Abi’l-Hadid in his *Sharhe Nahju’l-Balagha*, Volume I, page 240 and Volume II, pages 375-87, Yaqubi in his *History*, Volume II, page 148; Abu’l-Hasan Ali Bin Husain Mas’udi, the famous traditionalist and historian of the fourth century in his *Muruju’dh-Dhahab*, Volume I, page 438, and many others have recorded Uthman’s cruelty. It has been widely reported how he mistreated the pure-hearted Abu Dharr, the loved one of the Holy Prophet, and also

how Abdullah Bin Mas’ud, the hafiz and recorder of Wahi, who was given forty lashes because he bid farewell to Abu Dharr Ghifari. Insulting treatment was likewise shown to Ali for the same reason.

7. The wife of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) came out to fight against the Holy Imam Ali (a.s.).
8. Ayesha went to Basra. Uthman Bin Hanafi, a great companion of the Prophet and governor of Basra appointed by Ali, was captured there. His hair and beard were pulled out; he was tortured and driven out. More than 100 innocent, helpless Muslims were killed. Ibn Athir, Mas’udi, Muhammad Bin Jarir Tabari, Ibn Abi’l-Hadid, and others have written in detail about this event.
9. Abu’l-Faraj Ispahani in his *Maqatilu’t-Talibin*, Ibn Abdu’l-Bar in his *Isti’ab*, Mas’udi in his *Isbatu’l-Wasiyya*, and many other ulema have reported that Asma Ju’da, by order and promise of Mu’awiya, gave poison to Abu Muhammad Hasan Ibn Ali. Ibn Abdu’l-Bar and Muhammad Bin Jarir Tabari have also reported that when Mu’awiya was informed of the passing away of the holy imam, he shouted the takbir (“Allah is Great”).
10. When Amr Bin As and Mu’awiya Bin Khadij conquered Egypt, the supply of water was cut off to Muhammad Bin Abu Bakr. When he had nearly died of thirst, he was killed. He was then enclosed in the

skin of an ass and the bundle was thrown into a fire. When Mu'awiya learned of this, he was very pleased.

11. Sunni eminent ulema and historians, including Yusuf Sibt Ibn Jauzi in his Tadhkira Khawasu'l-Umma, p.122; Allama Mas'udi, author of Muruju'z-Dhahab, in Isbatu'l-Wasiyya, p.136; Ibn Abi'l-Hadid in Sharh-e-Nahju'l-Balagha, vol. IV, p.18, reporting from Abu'l-Faraj and Yahya Bin Hasan, author of Kitabu'n-Nasab; Muhammad Khwawind Shah in his Rauzatu's-Safa, and many others have written that when the corpse of Imam Hasan was being transported to Medina, A'ysha, mounted on a mule and accompanied by a group of the Bani Umayya and their slaves, stopped the group with Imam Hasan's body. They said that they would not let Imam Hasan be buried by the side of the Holy Prophet. According to the report of Mas'udi, Ibn Abbas said: "It is strange of you, A'ysha! Was not the Day of Jamal, that is, your entering the battlefield mounted on a camel, sufficient for you? Now should the people also keep in memory the Day of Baghl (mule)?"
12. Differences in the four schools of thought namely shaafei, Maaliki, Hanmbali and hanafi, which came in after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had been so intense that they used to go to the extent of calling each other infidels.

An Analysis of events & differences

The above indisputably shows that there did exist tremendous differences and an increasingly pathetic state of affairs of the Muslims right after the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). It will be absolutely wrong to endeavor and find out the roots to the causes of the plight of the contemporary Muslim, without actually finding out the roots to the pathetic status of the Muslims immediately after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

It is eventually the pathetic status of the Muslims immediately after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) which has been inherited by the present day Muslim. But the big question is - How, in this seemingly confusing situation, do we find the truth? How do we analyze the events taking shape after the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)?

The Ahle sunnat provide a theory of 'Ijma.' They boldly mention that INSPITE of the major differences amongst the Muslims, the Muslims were all very much united on one platform. Yes, it is like saying that the trouser has 40,000 holes in it but still it is perfect & You can wear it!

This is illogical & unacceptable to an inquiring mind ! If the Muslims had more than 40,000 deep-rooted differences of which the above 12 are glaring evidences, then it means they were NOT united & had differences – as simple as this.

Let us not follow the words "If the facts don't fit the theory, change the facts - Albert Einstein (1879 - 1955) (attributed).

Indeed, if the theory does not fit the facts we need to change the theory.

If we ponder on this and sincerely endeavor to seek the truth, we will understand that these kinds of disturbances were not exclusive to the Muslim society. Any community which has so many resources under it and has huge power, will get involved in this kind of strife, IF the previous leader does not designate one single leader. If the previous leader leaves the community without designating his heir for the community and the community has such resources it can very easily be predicted that enormous strife and disturbances will follow in the community. Hence this ultimately devolves on the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). If the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had to avoid disturbances after him then he HAD to appoint his heir. There was absolutely no chance ,that the Muslim ummat would have remained safe from disturbances and internal strife, if there was no ONE SINGLE person appointed as the Holy Prophets (s.a.w.a.)'s heir and appointed BEFORE the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).SO... If a person says that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) did not appoint anyone, as his heir throughout his lifetime, then he is most certainly attributing an error, short sightedness and a shortcoming on the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) – may Allah (s.w.t.) protect everyone from such an assumption.

Hence, after all the pains we have taken we have at least understood the following:

1. Plight of the present day Muslims are not related purely to the present day problems, but are inherited

from the past; that is ultimately inherited from the problems faced by Muslims immediately after the passing away of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

2. The problems of the Muslims immediately after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) were because they were not united under one single banner of TRUTH.
3. The Muslims after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) were not united under one banner of truth, because the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) did not identify this banner of truth by not appointing his heir. Thus the root cause of all the problems faced by the Muslims throughout so many centuries is the error of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) – May Allah (s.w.t.) protect us from such wild and false imaginations.!

The other possibility is; that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) DID APPOINT his heir and vicegerent BUT the majority of the Muslims disregarded it. Thus all the problems faced by the Muslims throughout so many centuries whether it be spiritual or material has to be attributed to this disregard of the appointed heir.

If it is true that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) did appoint an heir and vicegerent after him but the majority of the Muslims disregarded it, then we should do our utmost to find this appointment by the Holy Prophet(s.a.w.a.).Let us utilize all the latest tools available to mankind to scan and find out the moment in the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) when he appointed his heir and vicegerent.

If we study the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), we will find out that we do not require any tools (no microscopes /telescopes etc) to locate where and how did the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appoint his heir. In fact his life is FULL of small and big incidences wherein he has announced his heir. He has not hidden these events anywhere and has not made this appointment ambiguous. These kinds of REPEATED announcements by the holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), of his heir are ABUNDANT in his life time and are CLEAR. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was far too merciful to have possibly concealed the appointment. The Holy Quran says:

“Certainly an apostle has come to you from among yourselves; grievous to him is your falling into distress, excessively solicitous respecting you; to the believers (he is) compassionate, merciful.”¹

GHADIR

There are MANY small and big instances, wherein the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has mentioned the appointment of his heir, commencing from Dawat Zul Ashira- the first public invitation to Islam upto his death .These are not detailed here except for , the event of Ghadir which is the biggest occasion. After completion of the last pilgrimage of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), he collected all the Muslims possibly available, at a place called Ghadir-e-khumm and then announced the appointment of Ali (a.s.) as his heir and vicegerent in no

¹ 9:128.

uncertain terms. We now need to elaborate this event in a greater detail.

Location of Ghadir:

Ghadir literary means small lake or pond.¹ Ghadir is the name of a place that comes on the way from Makkah to Medina. It is 3 miles further than Johfa towards Medina. There existed a small pond at this place. Though geographically it exists on the way to Medina but this place acted as an exit point for all the people going out from Makkah for all the other places. When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) halted at this place after his last pilgrimage to make his all-significant announcement it was extremely hot at that time and it was close to mid-day. It was a wayside tract of barren land. There was no shelter present over there at that time. In fact there existed merely small minor patches of shades provided by a few acacia trees.

Date

The date is 18th Zilhajjah of the year 10 A.H. (10 March 632 CE)

Event Backdrop:

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) asked his companions to call the Muslims in general to attend for a pilgrimage to the Holy Kaaba. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) specified that he himself would also be there to attend for the pilgrimage and teach the Muslims the rituals of the pilgrimage and convey his

¹ Al-Munjjid.

significant messages directly to all. The call for the pilgrimage was made. On his way to Makkah more than 70,000 Muslims joined him. By the fourth of Zilhajjah more than 100,000 Muslims had collected for the Haj with the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

After the Last pilgrimage:

After completing the last pilgrimage the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) along with the Muslims set out of Makkah. On their way back the Muslims reached a place called Ghadir-e-khumm. The following verse was revealed to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

“O Apostle! Deliver what has been sent down to you from your Lord; and if you don’t do it, you have not delivered His message (at all); and Allah will protect you from the people ...”¹

Delivery of the sermon:

On receiving the above verse, the Holy Prophet stopped at that very place called Ghadir-e-khumm. He ordered his companions to call back those of the Muslims who had gone ahead. He waited for those Muslims who had remained behind to join them. He ordered Salman (a.r.) to prepare for a pulpit with the help of rocks and camel toolings. It was prime noontime and Muslims had tied their heads and legs on

¹ Quran 5:67.

account of the heat. Muslims had started to sit near the temporary pulpit. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was at this place for about 5 hours. He recited nearly 100 verses of the Holy Quran most of which were in the praise of Ali (a.s.). Seventy three times he reminded and admonished the Muslims about their deeds and future.

The following is a part of the lengthy speech (see www.duas.org/ghadir for full text) of the Holy Prophet(s.a.w.a.) which has also been narrated by the sunni authorities repeatedly:

“It seems the time has approached when I shall be called away (by Allah swt) and I shall answer that call. I am leaving for you two precious things and if you adhere to them BOTH, you will never go astray after me. They are the Book of Allah and my Progeny, that is my Ahlul Bayt. The two shall never separate from each other until they come to me by the Pool (of Paradise).”

Then the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in an attempt to remind Muslims of his own authority over them said:

“Do I not have more right over the believers than what they have over themselves?”

Muslims answered unanimously “Yes, O’ Messenger of God.” This served as a stepping stone for the announcement of his heir and vicegerent. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) held out the hand of Ali (a.s.) and said:

“For whoever I am his Leader (mawla), ‘Ali is his Leader (mawla).”

The Holy Prophet then continued to say:

“O’ God, love those who love him, and be hostile to those who are hostile to him.”

Revelation of the verse 5:3

Once the Holy Prophet(s.a.w.a.) completed his speech this verse of the Holy Quran was revealed to him:

“Today I have perfected your religion and completed my favour upon you, and I am satisfied that Islam be your religion.”¹

This verse explicitly mentions that only along with this express announcement of the vicegerancy by the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) can the religion of Islam be considered as complete and perfect. Without this announcement or because of the disregard of this announcement the religion of Islam will be incomplete & a half truth. As indicated earlier many a times half truths are more dangerous than full falsehoods. Hence there is no doubt that ,if the Muslims disregard this announcement, they will have to endure oppression and hardship both materially and spiritually.

Hassan Bin Thabit’s poetry:

Immediately after completion of the sermon Hassan Bin Thabit sought the permission of the Holy Prophet to convey to the audience his poetry which he had instantaneously

¹ 5:3.

composed regarding this event of ghadir. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) told him “Say with the blessings of Allah”. He then conveyed the following verses of his poetry to the audience: “He calls them, (on) the day of Ghadir, their Prophet In Khumm so hear (and heed) the Messenger’s call, He said:

“Who is your guide and leader? (mawlakum wa waliyyukum)”

They said, and there was no apparent blindness (clearly):

“Your God, our guide, and you are our leader

And you won’t find from among us, in this, any disobedient,”

He said to him: “Stand up O’ Ali, for I am pleased to announce you Imam and guide after me (min ba’di imam (an) wa hadiy (an)),

So whomever I was his leader (mawla), then this is his leader (mawla)

So be to him supporters in truth and followers,”

Oath of allegiance:

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) keeping to his long term merciful nature towards the Muslims did not get rest only on this announcement. He wanted this announcement to take the shape of appropriate action from the side of the Muslims. In view of this, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered the Muslims to meet Ali (a.s.) and give oath of allegiance to him. Umar Bin AL-Khattab came first to Ali (a.s.), gave oath of allegiance to Ali (a.s.) and said “Well done Ibn Abi Talib! Today you

became the Leader (mawla) of all believing men and women.” After Umar was Abu Bakr, Uthman, Talha and then others. The entire process of giving allegiance to Ali (a.s.) by the then present 120,000 people took 3 days.

Revelation of the verse 70:1-3

The news about the above announcement and the subsequent allegiance of oath given by the Muslims to Ali (a.s.) spread across both the urban and rural areas. This event was so significant that it touched the Muslims all across the globe. In this process Harith Ibn Nu'man al-Fahri (or Nadhr Ibn Harith according to another tradition) came to know about this. He hurriedly came to Madinah and started disputing with the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) on the issue of appointment of Ali (a.s.) as the vicegerant. He told the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) “You commanded us to testify that there is no deity but Allah and that you are the Messenger of Allah. We obeyed you. You ordered us to perform the prayers five times a day and we obeyed. You ordered us to observe fasts during the month of Ramadhan and we obeyed. Then you commanded us to offer pilgrimage to Makkah and we obeyed. But you are not satisfied with all this and you raised your cousin by your hand and imposed him upon us as our master by saying ‘Ali is the mawla of whom I am mawla.’ Is this imposition from Allah or from you?”

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“By Allah who is the only deity! This is from Allah, the Mighty and the Glorious.”

On hearing this while going back to his she camel Harith said “O Allah! If what Muhammad said is correct then fling on us a stone from the sky and subject us to severe pain and torture.” He had not even reached his camel that Allah (s.w.t.) flung a stone on him, which struck him on his head and penetrated his entire body and he was instantaneously left dead. At this the following verse was revealed

“A questioner questioned about the punishment to fall. For the disbelievers there is nothing to avert it, from Allah the Lord of the Ascent.”¹

We have mentioned above the entire episode of the Ghadir. But unfortunately even after knowing and understanding the entire truth we see heads move in rejecting the truth.

Three Basic Excuses given for non acceptance of the Ghadir appointment & their Rebuttals:

There are basically 3 excuses which the opponents offer. Though these excuses are self-evident to be no more than futile excuses, we will deal with them in detail so that the opponents do not have any excuse left.

Excuse 1. The tradition of Ghadir is not reliable and authentic.

¹ 70:1-3.

Excuse 2. The word 'Maula' used in the tradition does not imply Master, but it means friend. Hence the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) actually announced about the friendship of Ali (a.s.) on the day of Ghadir and not about mastership of Ali (a.s.).

Excuse 3. It does not appeal to our common sense that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appointed Ali (a.s.) as his successor in clear terms and still the companions of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) disobeyed him and after his death appointed a vicegerent by themselves.

Each one of the above excuses are dealt below separately & such details, as to dispel all doubts and lay bare the mischief of the mischief-makers.

Excuse 1: The tradition of Ghadir is not reliable and authentic.

Rebuttal of Excuse 1:

A. Sunni references for the verse 5:67 revealed in relation and just before the tradition of Ghadir. Though there are at least 69 chains of transmitters present for this from Sunni sources but due to lack of space we will mention only 9 books:

1. Yanabi' al-mawaddah - Khwajah Kalan, Sulayman b. Ibrahim, al-Husayni al-Balkhi al-Qunduzi al-Hanafi.
2. al-'Arba'in fi fada'il Amir al-Mu'minin - Jamal al-Din 'Ata' Allah b. Fadl Allah, al-Husayni al-Shirazi.

3. Al-Durr al-Manthur - al-Suyuti, Jalal al-Din 'Abd al-Rahman b. Kamal al-Din Abi Bakr, al-Shafi'i.
 4. Tafsir Kashf wa'l-bayan - Al-Tha'labi, Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Ibrahim, Abu Ishaq al-Nisaburi.
 5. Asbab al-Nuzul - al-Wahidi, Abu al-Hasan 'Ali b. Ahmad b. Muhammad b. 'Ali b. Mattawayh, al-Naysaburi.
 6. al-Dirayah fi Hadith al-Wilayah (Kitab al-wilayah) - Mas'ud b. Nasir b. 'Abd Allah b. Ahmad, Abu Sa'id al-Sijzi (al-Sijistani).
 7. Shawahid al-tanzil - Ibn Haddad al-Haskani, 'Ubayd Allah b. 'Abd Allah, Abu al-Qasim al-Hakim al-Nisaburi al-Hanafi.
 8. Mafatih al-Ghayb (Tafsir al-kabir) - Fakhr al-Din al-Razi, Muhammad b. 'Umar b. al-Hasan, Abu 'Abd Allah al-Shafi'i.
 9. Matalib al-sa'ul fi manaqib Al al-Rasul - Muhammad b. Talhah, Abu Salim al-Qarashi al-Nasibi al-Shafi'i.
- B. Sunni references regarding the tradition of Ghadir. Here it is more than sufficient to mention that Allama Amini has mentioned this tradition from 110 companions of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and 84 second generation (Ta'biun) and 360 sunni ulema. In fact at other places another 200 sunni ulema references are given which takes the number of sunni ulema to have related the tradition of Ghadir to at least 560! Because of conciseness & lack of space, we will mention only 9 references from sunni sources who have related the tradition of Ghadir and that too have

specifically mentioned the words of “For whoever I am his Leader (mawla), ‘Ali is his Leader (mawla).”:

1. Al-Bidayah wa'l-Nihayah fi al-Ta'rikh - Ibn Kathir, 'Imad al-Din Isma'il b. 'Umar b. Kathir b. Daw', al-Qarashi al-Dimashqi.
2. Manaqib 'Ali b. Abi Talib - Ibn Hanbal, Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Hanbal b. Hilal b. Asad, Abu 'Abd Allah al-Shaybani al-Marwazi.
3. Al-Musnad - Ibn Hanbal, Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Hanbal b. Hilal b. Asad, Abu 'Abd Allah al-Shaybani al-Marwazi.
4. Kanz al-'ummal fi sunan al-aqwal wa'l af'al - Nur al-Din 'Ali b. 'Abd al-Malik Husam al-Din al-Muttaqi al-Hindi.
5. Sunan - Ibn Majah, Muhammad b. Yazid, Abu 'Abd Allah al-Qazwini.
6. Al-Musannaf - Ibn Abi Shaybah, 'Abd Allah b. Muhammad b. Ibrahim b. 'Uthman, Abu Bakr al-'Absi al-Kufi.
7. al-'Iktifa fi fadl al-'arba'ah al-khulafa' - Ibrahim b. 'Abd Allah, al-Wassabi al-Yamani al-Shafi'i.
8. Al-Khasa'is fi fadl 'Ali b. Abi Talib - al-Nasa'i, Ahmad b. Shu'ayb b. 'Ali b. Sinan b. Bahr, Abu 'Abd al-Rahman al-Khurasani al-Nasa'i.
9. Miftah al-naja fi manaqib Al al-'aba - Mirza Muhammad b. Mu'tamad Khan al-Harithi al-Badakhshi (al-Badakhshani).

C. Sunni references about the verse 5:3 being revealed immediately after the sermon of Ghadir. Again here we can provide at least 35 chains of transmitters but we will mention only 9 sunni books to confirm:

1. Manaqib 'Ali b. Abi Talib - Ibn al-Maghazili, 'Ali b. Muhammad, Abu al-Hasan al-Tayyib al-Jullabi al-Shafi'i.
2. Miftah al-naja fi manaqib Al al-'aba - Mirza Muhammad b. Mu'tamad Khan al-Harithi al-Badakhshi (al-Badakhshani).
3. Ma nazala min al-Qur'an fi 'Ali - Abu Nu'aym, Ahmad b. 'Abd Allah, al-'Isfahani.
4. Manaqib 'Ali b. Abi Talib - Ibn al-Maghazili, 'Ali b. Muhammad, Abu al-Hasan al-Tayyib al-Jullabi al-Shafi'i.
5. al-Khasa'is al-'Alawiyyah - Muhammad b. 'Ali b. Ibrahim, Abu al-Fath al-Natanzi.
6. Kitab al-Manaqib - Khatib al-Khawarazmi, Muwaffaq b. Ahmad, Abu al-Mu'ayyad al-Makki, known as Akhtab al-Muwaffaq.
7. Al-Durr al-Manthur - al-Suyuti, Jalal al-Din 'Abd al-Rahman b. Kamal al-Din Abi Bakr, al-Shafi'i.
8. Fara'id al-samtayn fi fada'il al-Murtada wa al-batul wa al-sibtayn - al-Juwayni, Ibrahim b. Muhammad b. al-Mu'ayyad, Sadr al-Din Abu al-Majami' al-Hamawayni or al-Hamawi al-Shafi'i.

9. Tafsir al-Qur'an al-'Azim - Ibn Kathir, 'Imad al-Din Isma'il b. 'Umar b. Kathir b. Daw', al-Qarashi al-Dimashqi.

D. References of Hassan Bin. Thabits poetry:

1. Ma nazala min al-Qur'an fi 'Ali - Abu Nu'aym, Ahmad b. 'Abd Allah, al-'Isfahani.
2. Fara'id al-samtayn fi fada'il al-Murtada wa al-batul wa al-sibtayn - al-Juwayni, Ibrahim b. Muhammad b. al-Mu'ayyad, Sadr al-Din Abu al-Majami' al-Hamawayni or al-Hamawi al-Shafi'i.
3. Kashf al-ghamma fi ma'rifat al-A'immah - al-Irbili, 'Ali b. 'Isa b. Abi al-Fath, Abu al-Hasan al-'Irbili.
4. al-'Azhar fi ma 'aqdahu al-shu'ara' min al-'ash'ar - al-Suyuti, Jalal al-Din 'Abd al-Rahman b. Kamal al-Din Abi Bakr, al-Shafi'i.
5. Kifayat al-Talib - Muhammad b. Yusuf b. Muhammad, Abu 'Abd Allah al-Kanji al-Shafi'i.
6. al-Khasa'is al-'Alawiyyah - Muhammad b. 'Ali b. Ibrahim, Abu al-Fath al-Natanzi.
7. Tadhkirat khawass al-'ummah fi ma'rifat al-a'immah - Sibb b. al-Jawzi, Shams al-Din Yusuf b. Qizughli, Abu al-Muzaffar.

E. References of Oath of allegiance as mentioned above:

1. Al-Bidayah wa'l-Nihayah fi al-Ta'rikh - Ibn Kathir, 'Imad al-Din Isma'il b. 'Umar b. Kathir b. Daw', al-Qarashi al-Dimashqi.

2. Manaqib 'Ali b. Abi Talib - Ibn Hanbal, Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Hanbal b. Hilal b. Asad, Abu 'Abd Allah al-Shaybani al-Marwazi.
3. Al-Musannaf - Ibn Abi Shaybah, 'Abd Allah b. Muhammad b. Ibrahim b. 'Uthman, Abu Bakr al-'Absi al-Kufi.
4. Fada'il 'Ali - 'Abd Allah b. Ahmad b. Hanbal, Abu 'Abd al-Rahman al-Shaybani.
5. al-Fusul al-muhimmah li ma'rifat al-a'immah - Ibn al-Sabbagh, Nur al-Din 'Ali b. Muhammad b. Ahmad, al-Ghazzi al-Maliki.
6. Manaqib Al Abi Talib - Ibn Shahrashub, Muhammad b. 'Ali, Abu Ja'far.
7. Sharaf al-Mustafa - 'Abd al-Malik b. Muhammad, Abu Sa'd al-Wa'iz al-Nisaburi al-Kharkushi (al-Khargushi).
8. Tafsir Kashf wa'l-bayan - Al-Tha'labi, Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Ibrahim, Abu Ishaq al-Nisaburi.
9. Riyad al-Nadirah - Muhibb al-Din Ahmad b. 'Abd Allah, Abu al-'Abbas al-Tabari al-Makki al-Shafi'i.

Again we limit to 9 books references. There are otherwise atleast 76 chains of narrators mentioned in books for this.

F. The revelation of the verse 70:1-3 is regarding the event of the dispute of Harith as mentioned earlier. References for this are:

1. al-'Arba'in fi fada'il Amir al-Mu'minin - Jamal al-Din 'Ata' Allah b. Fadl Allah, al-Husayni al-Shirazi.
2. Tafsir Kashf wa'l-bayan - Al-Tha'labi, Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Ibrahim, Abu Ishaq al-Nisaburi.

3. Tadhkirat khawass al-'ummah fi ma'rifat al-a'imma - Sibt b. al-Jawzi, Shams al-Din Yusuf b. Qizughli, Abu al-Muzaffar.
4. al-'Iktifa fi fadl al-'arba'ah al-khulafa' - Ibrahim b. 'Abd Allah, al-Wassabi al-Yamani al-Shafi'i.
5. Hidayat al-su'ada' - Shihab al-Din Ahmad b. Shams al-Din 'Umar, Malik al-'Ulama' al-Zawali al-Dawlatabadi.
6. Ma'arij al-wusul - al-Zarandi, Jamal al-Din Muhammad b. Yusuf b. al-Hasan al-Madani al-'Ansari al-Hanafi.
7. Wasilat al-ma'al fi 'add manaqib al-'Al - Ba Kathir al-Makki, Ahmad b. al-Fadl b. Muhammad, al-Shafi'i.
8. Jawahir al'iqdayn fi fadl al-sharafayn sharaf al-'ilm al-jali wa al-nasab al-'ali - al-Samhudi, Nur al-Din 'Ali b. 'Abd Allah b. Ahmad, al-Hasani al-Shafi'i.
9. al-Fusul al-muhimmah li ma'rifat al-a'imma - Ibn al-Sabbagh, Nur al-Din 'Ali b. Muhammad b. Ahmad, al-Ghazzi al-Maliki.

Again we are unable to mention other sources due space constraints. There are at least 31 chains of transmitters for this.

Excuse 2 :The word Maula used in the tradition does not imply master but it means friend. Hence the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)actually announced about the friendship of Ali (a.s.) on the day of Ghadir and not about mastership of Ali (a.s.).

Rebuttal of Excuse 2:

Though multitude of reasons could be proffered to nullify the above excuse we will mention only 5 of them:

- A. The first proof is the Holy Qur'an and the revelation of the verse:

“O Apostle! deliver that which has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people.”¹

Qazi in Kashf Ghumma gives a report from Razi Bin Abdullah: “In the days of the Holy Prophet we used to read this verse thus:

‘O our Prophet (Muhammad) deliver what has been sent down to you from your Lord, that is, Ali is the master of the believers. If you do not, then you have not delivered His message.’

Also Suyuti in his Durru'l-Mansur from Ibn Mardawiyya, Ibn Asakir and Ibn Abi Hatim from Abu Sa'id Khadiri, Abdullah Ibn Mas'ud (one of the writers of Wahi - revelations) and Qazi Shukani in Tafsir-e-Fathu'l-Ghadir narrate that in the day of the Holy Prophet they also recited that verse in that very way. In short, the warning contained in this verse says: “If you do it not then (it will be as if) you have not delivered His message (at all)...” shows that the message which the Holy Prophet had been ordered to deliver was of great importance. It was in fact

¹ 5.67.

essential to the completion of Prophethood itself. Therefore, the issue in question was surely the matter of the imamate, the conferring of authority on one who would guide the people according to the tenets of Islam after the death of the Holy Prophet. This important issue cannot be the friendship of someone by any stretch of imagination.

B. Second proof is the revelation of the verse

“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed my favor on you and chosen for you Islam for a religion.”¹

Scholars trusted by sunnis, such as Jalalu’d-din Suyuti in Durru’l-Mansur, vol. II, p. 256 and Itqan, vol. I, p. 31; Imamu’l-Mufasssirin Tha’labi in Kashfu’l-Bayan; Hafiz Abu Nu’aim Ispahani in Ma Nusala Mina’l-Qur’an Fi Ali; Abu’l-Fatha Nazari in Khasa’isu’l-Alawi; Ibn Kathir Shami in Tafsir, vol. II, p. 41, following Hafiz Ibn Mardawiyya: Muhammad Bin Jarir Tabari, scholar, commentator and historian of the 3rd century A.H. in Tafsir-e-Kitabu’l-Wilaya; Hafiz Abu’l-Qasim Haskani in Shawahid-ut-Tanzil; Sibte Ibn Jauzi in Tadhkira-e-Khawasu’l-Umma, p. 18; Abu Ishaq Hamwaini in Fara’id-us-Simtain, ch. XII; Abu Sa’id Sijistani in Kitabu’l-Wilaya; Al-Khatib-e-Baghdadi in Ta’rikh-e-Baghdad, vol. VIII, p. 290; Ibn Maghazili Faqih Shafi’i in Manaqib, ch. XIV and Maqtalu’l-Husain, ch. IV, all have written that on the day of Ghadir-e-Khum the Holy Prophet appointed Ali by divine

¹ 5:3.

order to the rank of wilaya (Vicegerent). He told the people whatever he was ordained to say about Ali and raised his hands so high that the white of both his armpits was visible. He addressed the people thus: “Salute Ali because he is the Amir (lord) of the believers. The whole Community complied with his order. They had not yet departed from one another when the aforesaid verse was revealed.” The Holy Prophet was highly pleased with the revelation of this verse. So, addressing the people, he said:

“Allah is Great, He who has perfected for them their religion and has completed His favor on them and is satisfied with my Prophethood and Ali’s vicegerency after me.”

C. In that hot desert, where there was no protection for the travelers, the Holy Prophet gathered the whole umma. People sat in the shade of the camels, with their feet covered, in the scorching heat of the sun. In these conditions the Prophet delivered a long address, which Khawarizmi and Ibn Mardawiyya in their Manaqib, and Tabari in his Kitabu’l-Wilaya and others have narrated. Does it make sense to think that the Prophet would require thousands of his followers to spend three days in the blazing desert to swear allegiance to Ali merely to indicate that Ali was their friend? It is reasonable to conclude therefore, that these arrangements were made not merely to indicate that people should befriend Ali. The event, in fact, marked the completion of the Prophet’s message: the

establishment of the Imamate, the source of the umma's guidance after the death of the Prophet.

- D. Some of sunni reputable ulema have acknowledged that the primary meaning of "maula" is "master." Among them is Sibt Ibn Jauzi, who after giving ten meanings of the word in his Tadhkira-e-Khawass, ch. II, p. 20, says that none of them except the tenth one corresponds with what the Holy Prophet meant to say. He says: "The hadith specifically means obedience; so the tenth meaning is correct, and it means 'mastery over others.' Hence, the hadith means 'of whoever I am the 'maula' (master) Ali is also his 'maula' (master)." In the book Maraju'l-Bahrain Hafiz Abdu'l-Faraj Yahya Bin Sa'id Saqafi interprets it in the same way. He narrates this hadith with his own sources from his leaders, who said that the Holy Prophet, holding Ali by the hand, said:

"Of whomsoever I am 'wali' or master over himself, Ali is also his 'wali' or master over himself."

Sibt Ibn Jauzi says, "The saying of the Holy Prophet that Ali has authority or is the master over the selves of all the believers clearly proves the Imamate or vicegerency of Ali and that obedience to him is obligatory."

- E. Ali (a.s.) himself has referred to the tradition of Ghadir to mean master and has emphasised that he was clearly appointed as the vicegerant at Ghadir. Also others have referred to this event in form of ihtejaj (protest) or

Munashadah (adjuration). Some places where Ali (a.s.) has reminded the event of Ghadir vis-a-vis his appointment as vicegerant are:

- (a.) On the day of shura (counsel after Umar's death).
- (b.) During the days of Uthmans rule.
- (c.) The Day of Rahbah (year 35 AH) when many Companions stood up and bore witness that they attended and heard the tradition of the Prophet [s] first hand, twelve of whom were the participants of the Battle of Badr.
- (d.) The Battle of al-Jamal, year 36 AH where he reminded Talhah b. 'Ubaydullah.
- (e.) The Day of the Rukban (riders) where several witnesses testified.
- (f.) The Day of Battle of Siffin (year 37 AH).

Other members of the Household reminded people:

- (a.) Ihtejaj by Fatimah al-Zahra' (s.a.).
- (b.) Munashadah by Imam Husein (a.s.)
- (c.) Munashadah by Imam Husayn (a.s.).

Other munashadahs and ihtejaj: munashadah of youth with Abu Hurayrah; Ihtijaj of Abd Allah b. Ja'far with Mu'awiyah; Ihtijaj in refutation of Amr b. al-'Asi; Ihtijaj of Amr b. al-'Asi with Mu'awiyah; Ihtijaj of Ammar b. Yasir on day of Siffin; Ihtijaj of Asbagh b. Nubata in a sitting with Mu'awiyah; Munashadah of a man with Zayd b. Arqam; Munashadah of an Iraqi man with Jabir b. Abd Allah al-Ansari; Ihtijaj of Qays al-Ansari with Mu'awiyah in Madinah; Ihtijaj Darmiyyah al-Hajwaniyyah with Mu'awiyah; Ihtijaj of Amr al-Awdi; Ihtijaj

of Umar b. Abd al-aziz, the Umayyad caliph; ihtijaj of Ma'mun, the Abbasid caliph, with jurists.

The above clearly refutes the second excuse and renders it baseless.

Excuse 3 :It does not appeal to our common sense that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appointed Ali (a.s.) as his successor in clear terms and still the companions of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) disobeyed him and after his death appointed a vicegerent by themselves.

Rebuttal of Excuse 3:

- A. This excuse may be common (commonly used frivolous argument) but it is not sensible. Common sense tells you that if any leader identifies a vicegerent and the followers and not entirely sincere then the followers will not abide by this appointment.
- B. Both the sects accept that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had said

“You are to me as Aaron was to Moses except that there shall be no prophet after me.”

Now let us analyse the similarities between Aaron and Ali (a.s.) so that we come to understand how it is possible for the companions of a Prophet to disobey and disregard the clear appointment of the vicegerent. The Holy Qur'an states that when Moses appointed Aaron his successor, he gathered round him the Bani Isra'il (according to some reports, 70,000

people). Moses emphasized that in his absence they should obey Aaron, his Caliph and successor. Moses then went up the mountain to be alone with Allah. Before a month passed, Samiri incited dissension among the Isra'ilis. He fashioned a golden calf and the Bani Isra'il, having left Aaron, gathered round the treacherous Samiri in large numbers. It had been only a short time before this that the same Bani Isra'il had heard Moses say that during his absence Aaron was to be his Caliph and that they should obey him. Nevertheless, 70,000 people followed Samiri. The Prophet Aaron loudly protested this action and forbade them from indulging in such sinful acts, but no one listened to him. The verse of Sura A'raf states that when Moses came back, Aaron said to him:

“Son of my mother! Surely the people reckoned me weak and had well-nigh slain me...”¹

The Bani Isra'il themselves heard the clear instruction from Moses, but when Moses went up to the mountain, Samiri seized his opportunity. He fashioned a golden calf and misguided the Bani Isra'il. Similarly, after the death of the Prophet, some people who had heard him say that Ali was his successor, turned against Ali. Imam Ghazali referred to this fact in the beginning of his fourth treatise in Sirru'l-'Alamin. He states that some people returned to the state of their former ignorance. In this respect, there is great similarity between the situation of Aaron and that of Ali. Like many of renowned

¹ 7:150.

sunni scholars and historians, Abu Muhammad Abdullah Bin Muslim Bin Qutayba Bahili Dinawari, the well-known Qazi of Dinawar, in his *Al-Imama Wa Siyasa*, Volume I, page 14, narrates in detail the events of Saqifa. He says that they threatened to burn down Ali's house and they forcibly took him to the mosque and threatened to kill him unless he swore allegiance to them. Ali went to the sacred grave of the Prophet and repeated the same words of the Holy Qur'an which Aaron spoke to Moses:

“He (Aaron) said: Son of my mother! Surely the people reckoned me weak and had well-nigh slain me...”¹

C. Not all those 120,000 Muslims who were at Ghadir stayed at Madinah. Only a few thousand stayed at Madinah. Out of these also many were bedouins or slaves or poor men. Only a maximum of 100 influential people had gathered at Saqifa. So it will be wrong to say that all 120,000 people present at the day of Ghadir conspired and disobeyed the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Out of these only less than 100 influential people conspired and selected a vicegerent by themselves going against the verdict and order of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself. It should not astonish us that around 100 people went against the verdict of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

¹ 7:150.

- D. Communication system was not strong in those days. By the time everyone came to know of the selection of Abu Bakr against the verdict of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), it was too late. Abu Bakr had already become too powerful in material terms. Even if someone tried to oppose the ruling caliph he was silenced either through temptation or through intimidation. The episode of Malik Ibn Nuwayrah is a glaring example in this.
- E. All the companions were not obedient. There are so many instances to prove the disobedience of the companions.
- (a.) During the last days of his blessed life, the Messenger of God prepared an army to do battle with the Byzantines and he appointed Usamah b. Zayd to be its commander. This appointment of a young man, despite the availability of older and more experienced men, proved displeasing to some of the Companions, and led to an argument among them. Those who were strongly opposed to Usamah b. Zayd asked the Prophet to dismiss him, but he paid no attention to their request and commanded Abu Bakr, 'Umar and 'Uthman to join the ranks of the Muslim army as it departed from Madinah. However, they not only disregarded military discipline but also disobeyed the categorical command of the Prophet. Instead of proceeding to the front with the army, they split off and returned to Madinah - Ibn Hisham, *al-Sirah*, Vol. IV p. 338; *al-Ya'qubi, al-Tarikh*, Vol. II, p.92; *Ibn al-Athir, al-Kamil*, Vol. II, pp. 120-21.

(b.) Some Sunni historians and hadith scholars have written that when the Prophet decided to write a document that would prevent the Muslims from going astray ‘Umar said: “The Messenger of God has become delirious.” Others, however, in order to soften the offensiveness of his words, maintain that he said: “Sickness has overcome the Prophet; you have the Book of God at your disposal, which is enough for us.”¹ When companions could disobey the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in his presence they can very easily disobey in his absence after death.

But here it is worth mentioning that there were respectable and independent minded companions who did not change their position after the death of the Prophet. They obeyed the appointment of Ali (a.s.) as the vicegerent that took place at Ghadir. Although they were more or less compelled to remain silent, they remained loyal to ‘Ali b. Abi Talib, peace be upon him, as leader. Among the outstanding personalities belonging to this group were Salman al-Farisi, Abu Dharr al-Ghifari, Abu Ayyub al-Ansari, Khuzaymah b. Thabit, Miqdad b. al-Aswad, al-Kindi, ‘Ammar b. Yasir, Ubayy b. Ka’b, Khalid b. Sa’id, Bilal, Qays b. Sa’d, Aban, Buraydah al-Ashami, Abu ‘l-Haytham b. al-Tayyihan, as well as many others whose names are recorded in Islamic history. Some

scholars have listed two hundred and fifty Companions of the Prophet, complete with names and descriptions, as belonging to this class.

Ghadir in the words of a Non-Muslim:

We have enunciated sufficient reasons to dispel all possibilities for excuses. Here we would also like to quote an orientalist for sake of reference. Vaglieri has said in the Encyclopedia of Islam about Ghadir Khumm: It is, however, certain that Muhammad did speak in this place and utter the famous sentence, for the account of this event has been preserved, either in a concise form or in detail, not only by al-Ya’kubi, whose sympathy for the ‘Alid cause is well known, but also in the collection of traditions which are considered canonical, especially in the Musnad of Ibn Hanbal; and the hadiths are so numerous and so well attested by the different isnāds that it does not seem possible to reject them. Vaglieri continues, “Several of these hadiths are cited in the bibliography, but it does not include the hadīth which, although reporting the sentence, omit to name Ghadir Khumm, or those which state that the sentence was pronounced at al-Hudaybiya. The complete documentation will be facilitated when the Concordance of Wensinck have been completely published. In order to have an idea of how numerous these hadiths are, it is enough to glance at the pages in which Ibn Kathir has collected a great number of them with their isnads.”

¹ Muslim, al-Sahih, Vol. III, p. 1259; al-Bukhari, al-Sahih, Vol. IV, p. 5; Ahmad b. Hanbal, al-Musnad, hadith no. 2992.,

Ghadir as a feast:

Muhammad Bin Talha Shafi'i in his Matalibu's-Su'ul in Part V, ch. 1, p. 16, says "In this hadith (of Ghadir) the Holy Prophet indicated that whatever obligations the believers had in respect to him, they had also in respect to Ali. As the Holy Prophet was certainly master of the believers in all of their matters, their helper, leader, and chief – all of these being connotations of the word "maula" – then it follows that he meant the same thing for Ali (a.s.) also. And this is of course, an exalted position, an eminently high rank, which was specifically assigned to Ali. It is for this reason that the Day of Ghadir was a day of eid and rejoicing for the lovers and friends of Ali."

Also Ibne Khalakan in Vafiyaat-ol-Ayan and Abu Rayhan Biruni in (Asar-al-Baghiyeh), besides so many others, considered Ghadir as one of the holidays that all Muslims realized and celebrated.

Ghadir in respect of the Present Imam (a.s.):

After all the painstaking efforts we are unmistakably able to conclude that the present problems of the Muslim Ummah are originally due to the mistakes and falsehood of the previous generation and not the present. This root of all falsehood is the disregard of the Holy Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) words when he appointed Ali (a.s.) at Ghadir.

Now if we would like to correct the error that had taken place in the earlier times, then Allah (s.w.t.) has given opportunity

to us. After Ali (a.s.) there are 11 more vicegerents. Like the tradition specifies:

Sheikh Sulayman Balkhi Hanafi in his Yanabiu'l-Mawadda, ch. 76, reports from Fara'idu's-Simtain of Hamwaini, who reports from Mujahid, who reports from Ibn Abbas, that a Jew named Na'thal came to the Holy Prophet and asked him questions about Tawhid (Unity of Allah). The Holy Prophet answered his questions and the Jew embraced Islam. Then he said: "O Holy Prophet, every prophet had a wasi (vicegerent). Our Prophet, Moses Bin Imran, made a will for Yusha Bin Nun. Please tell me who is your wasi?" The Holy Prophet said:

"My vicegerent is Ali Bin Abi Talib; after him are Hasan, and Husain and after them are nine Imams, who are the successive descendants of Husain."

Na'thal asked the Holy Prophet the names of those Imams. The Holy Prophet said: "After Husain, his son, Ali, will be the Imam; after him his son, Muhammad; after him his son, Ja'far; after him his son Musa; after him his son, Ali; after him his son, Muhammad; after him his son, Hasan; after him his son, Muhammad Mahdi will be the last Imam. There will be twelve Imams."

In addition to the names of the nine Imams, this hadith further states that each would succeed as Imam after his father. Na'thal made further inquiries, and the Holy Prophet described the manner of death of each Imam.

Then Na'thal said, "I bear witness that there is no god but Allah and that you are His Holy Prophet. I bear witness that these twelve holy Imams are your vicegerents after you. What you have said is exactly what is recorded in our books and in the will of Moses."

Then the Holy Prophet said:

"Paradise is for him who loves them and obeys them, and Hell is for him who is hostile to them and opposes them."

Na'thal then recited some couplets to the effect that "May Allah, the Exalted, shower His blessings upon you, chosen Prophet and pride of the Bani Hashim. Allah has guided us by means of you and the twelve holy men whom you have named. Certainly Allah has purified them and preserved them from impurity. He who loves them is successful. He who hates them is the loser. The last of the Imams will quench the thirst of the thirsty. He is the one the people will wait for. Prophet of Allah, your progeny is a blessing for me and for all the believers. Those who turn away from them will soon be thrown into Hell."

Our Opportunity to Obey the Prophet (sawa) & Ali (as)

Here we see that people get the opportunity to obey the present Imam even if he misses the time of the previous Imam. People got the opportunity to obey and serve the Imams of their respective times. Similarly WE have got the opportunity

to obey and serve the 12th Imam (a.t.f.s.). By this we can undo the past errors of the previous generations. We may wonder that Ali (a.s.) cannot be followed directly now because of his absence and the obedience required vis-à-vis the event of Ghadir cannot be apparently accomplished. But the truth is we can STILL accomplish, that obedience; by finding out & obeying the orders of the 12 successors & by submitting to the orders of the Imam (a.t.f.s.), the final vicegerent of Ali (a.s.), who is sitting at the position of Ali (a.s.) today. For increased benefits of the Imam (a.t.f.s.) we should be true expectants of the re-appearance of the Imam (a.t.f.s.). For with the re-appearance of the Imam (a.t.f.s.) we will receive justice and all the past errors will be set right by the Imam (a.s.). But to be the true expectants of the Imam (a.t.f.s.) we should at least take care of the following:

1. Acquire Marifat - True recognition of the Imam (a.t.f.s.) - Since everything starts with the true recognition without which it is impossible to proceed and obey him.
2. Learning our duties and submitting to the words of Imam (a.t.f.s.) - We must first learn our duties and then also find out & follow the words of the Imam (a.t.f.s.). If we do not follow the words of the Imam (a.t.f.s.) then what will be the difference between us and those who disobeyed the words of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) proclaimed at Ghadir?
3. Educating others about religion - Since Imam (a.t.f.s.) will be acting on a society basis and not only on an individual basis, it is necessary that we educate others so

as to form a more conducive society for the Imam (a.t.f.s.).

4. Awaiting the reappearance - we should await every moment that the Imam (a.t.f.s.) will reappear and hence should be prepared to participate in the revolution of Imam (a.s.).
5. Pray for the relief - There are 2 benefits in this praying, one is that before the social relief happens, our own individual relief will take place immediately. Second is that ,we will have our vital role to play in the social relief process.

Books related to Ghadir:

There are at least 185 sunni books which have mentioned the event of Ghadir. It is not possible to mention all of them here but we mention just a few:

1. The well known commentator and historian of the fourth century hijri, Abu Ja'far Muhammad Bin Jarir Tabari (died 310 A.H.), gives complete details of the hadith of Ghadir in his book Kitabu'l-Wilaya and has narrated it through seventy-five chains of transmission.
2. Hafiz Abu'l-Abbas Ahmad Bin Sa'id Abdu'r-Rahman Al-Kufi, popularly known as Ibn Iqda (died 333 A.H.), narrated this holy hadith in his book Kitabu'l-Wilaya through 125 chains on the authority of 125 companions of the Holy Prophet.
3. Ibn Haddad Hafiz Abu'l-Qasim Haskani (died 492 A.H.), in his Kitabu'l-Wilaya, has narrated in detail the event of

Ghadir along with the revelation of the verses of the Qur'an.

Similarly some of the many books of Shia authors who have shown the event of Ghadir by providing extensive Sunni sources are:

1. Al-Ghadir by Allama Amini - This is apparently the most magnanimous work on the event of Ghadir. This book is in 11 Volumes.
2. Abaqatul Anwar by Mir Hamid Husein – Lot of material available on the subject of ghadir using sunni references.
3. Nafahatul Azhaar by syed Ali Milaani - This is basically explanation of the book Abaqatul Anwar.
4. Ihkaakul Haq by shaheed-e-thalis Qazi Noorullah Shustri - this book has dealt the subject of Ghadir in many of its parts.

More information on Ghadir is also at www.al-islam.org

We end our article by quoting the verse of the Holy Quran

“And say: The truth has come and the falsehood has vanished; surely falsehood is a vanishing (thing).”¹

¹ 17:81.